

2. THE MACAULAY REPORT

(THE FULTON REPORT)

COPY of the Report, dated November 1854, from the Committee who were requested to take into Consideration the Subject of the EXAMINATION of CANDIDATES for the CIVIL SERVICE of the EAST INDIA COMPANY; and, Copy of the LETTER addressed on the 20th November 1854, by the President of the Board of Commissioners for the Affairs of India, to the Chairman and Deputy Chairman of the East India Company, as to the Company's COLLEGE at HALLEYBURY.

REPORT ON THE INDIAN CIVIL SERVICE.

TO THE RIGHT HONOURABLE SIR CHARLES WOOD, BART., M.P.,
&c. &c. &c.

Sir,

We have attentively considered the subject about which you have done us the honour to consult us; and we now venture to submit to you the result of our deliberations.

We do not think that we can more conveniently arrange the suggestions which we wish to offer than by following the order which is observed in the 39th and 40th clauses of the India Act of 1853.

The first matter concerning which the Board of Control is empowered by the 39th clause to make regulations is, the age of the persons who are to be admitted into the college at Haileybury.

The present rule is, that no person can be admitted under 17, and that no person can go out to India after 23. Every student must pass four terms, that is to say, two years at the college. Consequently, none can be admitted after 21.

It seems to us that it would be a great improvement to allow students to be admitted to the college up to the age of 23, and to fix 25 as the latest age at which they can go out to India in the civil service. It is undoubtedly desirable that the civil servant of the Company should enter on his duties while still young; but it is also desirable that he should have received the best, the most liberal, the most finished education that his native country affords. Such an education has been proved by experience to be the best preparation for every calling which requires the exercise of the higher powers of the mind; nor will it be easy to show that such preparation is less desirable in the case of a civil servant of the East India Company than in the case of a professional man who remains in England. Indeed, in the case of the civil servant of the Company a good general education is even more desirable than in the case of the English professional man; for the duties even of a very young servant of the Company are more important than those which ordinarily fall to the lot of a professional man in England. In England, too, a professional man may, while engaged in active business, continue to improve his mind by means of reading and of conversation. But the servant of the Company is often stationed, during a large part of his life, at a great distance from libraries and from European society, and will therefore find it peculiarly difficult to supply by study in his mature years the deficiencies of his early training.

The change which we propose will have one practical effect, to which we attach much importance. We think it desirable that a considerable number of the civil servants of the Company should be men who have taken the first degree in arts at Oxford or Cambridge. At present the line is drawn as if it had been expressly meant to exclude bachelors of those universities. It will, we believe, be found that the great majority of our academic youth graduate too late by a few months, and only by a few months, for admission into Haileybury.

We propose to fix 18 as the lowest age at which a candidate can be admitted into the college. We are indeed of opinion that, except in very rare and extraordinary cases, it is not desirable that a lad should be admitted so early as 18. But we are convinced

Appendix B

that, except in very rare and extraordinary cases, no lad of 18 will have any chance of being admitted. Hitherto the admissions have been given by favour. They are henceforward to be gained by superiority in an intellectual competition. While they were given by favour, they were frequently, indeed generally, given to persons whose age was not much above the minimum. A director would naturally wish his son or his nephew to be handsomely provided for at 19 rather than at 23, and to be able to return to England with a competence at 44 rather than at 48. A majority of the students have, therefore, been admitted before they were 19, and have gone out before they were 21. But it is plain that, in any intellectual competition, boys of 18 must be borne down by men of 21 and 22. We may therefore, we believe, safely predict that nine-tenths of those who are admitted to the college under the new system will be older than nine-tenths of those who quit it under the present system. We hope and believe that among the successful competitors will frequently be young men who have obtained the highest honours of Oxford and Cambridge. To many such young men a fellowship, or a tutorship, which must be held on condition of celibacy, will appear less attractive than a situation which enables the person who holds it to marry at an early age.

The India Act next empowers the Board of Control to determine the qualifications of the candidates for admission to Haileybury. It seems to us to be proper that every person who intends to be a candidate should, at least six weeks before the examination, notify his intention to the Board of Control, and should at the same time transmit a list of the subjects in which he proposes to be examined, in order that there may be time to provide a sufficient number of examiners in each department. He should, at the same time, lay before the Board testimonials certifying that his moral character is good. Whether the testimonials be or be not satisfactory is a point which we conceive may safely be left to the determination of the Board.

The Board is then authorised by the Act to make regulations prescribing the branches of knowledge in which the candidates for admission to Haileybury shall be examined. Here arises at once a question of the gravest importance. Ought the examination to be confined to those branches of knowledge to which it is desirable that English gentlemen who mean to remain at home should pay some attention?—or ought it to extend to branches of knowledge which are useful to a servant of the East India Company, but useless, or almost useless, to a person whose life is to be passed in Europe?

Our opinion is, that the examination ought to be confined to those branches of knowledge to which it is desirable that English gentlemen who mean to remain at home should pay some attention.

It is with much diffidence that we venture to predict the effect of the new system; but we think that we can hardly be mistaken in believing that the introduction of that system will be an event scarcely less important to this country than to India. The educated youth of the United Kingdom are henceforth to be invited to engage in a competition in which about 40 prizes will, on an average, be gained every year. Every one of these prizes is nothing less than an honourable social position, and a comfortable independence for life. It is difficult to estimate the effect which the prospect of prizes so numerous and so attractive will produce. We are, however, familiar with some facts which may assist our conjectures. At Trinity College, the largest and wealthiest of the colleges of Cambridge, about four fellowships are given annually by competition. These fellowships can be held only on condition of celibacy, and the income derived from them is a very moderate one for a single man. It is notorious that the examinations for Trinity fellowships have, directly and indirectly, done much to give a direction to the studies of Cambridge and of all the numerous schools which are the feeders of Cambridge. What, then, is likely to be the effect of a competition for prizes which will be ten times as numerous as the Trinity fellowships, and of which each will be more valuable than a Trinity fellowship? We are inclined to think that the examinations for situations in the civil service of the East India Company will produce an effect which will be felt in every seat of learning throughout the realm, at Oxford and Cambridge, at the University of London and the University of Durham, at Edinburgh and Glasgow, at Dublin, at Cork, and at Belfast. The number of candidates will doubtless be much greater than the number of vacancies. It will not surprise us if the ordinary number examined should be three or four hundred. The great majority, and among them many young men of excellent abilities and laudable industry, must be unsuccessful. If,

therefore, branches of knowledge specially Oriental should be among the subjects of examination, it is probable that a considerable number of the most hopeful youths in the country will be induced to waste much time, at that period of life at which time is most precious, in studies which will never, in any conceivable case, be of the smallest use to them. We think it most desirable that the examination should be of such a nature that no candidate who may fail shall, to whatever calling he may betake himself, have any reason to regret the time and labour which he spent in preparing himself to be examined.

Nor do we think that we should render any service to India by inducing her future rulers to neglect, in their earlier years, European literature and science, for studies specially Indian. We believe that men who have been engaged, up to one or two and twenty, in studies which have no immediate connexion with the business of any profession, and of which the effect is merely to open, to invigorate, and to enrich the mind, will generally be found, in the business of every profession, superior to men who have, at 18 or 19, devoted themselves to the special studies of their calling. The most illustrious English jurists have been men who have never opened a law book till after the close of a distinguished academical career; nor is there any reason to believe that they would have been greater lawyers if they had passed in drawing pleas and conveyances the time which they gave to Thucydides, to Cicero, and to Newton. The duties of a civil servant of the East India Company are of so high a nature that in his case it is peculiarly desirable that an excellent general education, such as may enlarge and strengthen his understanding, should precede the special education which must qualify him to despatch the business of his cutcherry.

It therefore seems to us quite clear that those vernacular Indian languages which are of no value except for the purpose of communicating with natives of India, ought not to be subjects of examination. But we are inclined, though with much distrust of our own judgment, to think that a distinction may properly be made between the vernacular languages, and two languages which may be called the classical languages of India, the Sanscrit and the Arabic. These classical languages are by no means without intrinsic value in the eyes both of philologists and of men of taste. The Sanscrit is the great parent stock from which most of the vernacular languages of India are derived, and stands to them in a relation similar to that in which the Latin stands to the French, the Italian, the Spanish, and the Portuguese. The Arabic has contributed, though not in the same degree with the Sanscrit, to the formation of the vocabularies of India; and it is the source from which all the Mahometan nations draw their religion, their jurisprudence, and their science. These two languages are already studied by a few young men at the great English seats of learning. They can be learned as well here as in the East; and they are not likely to be studied in the East unless some attention has been paid to them here. It will, we apprehend, very seldom happen that a candidate will offer himself for examination in Sanscrit or in Arabic; but, as such instances may occur, we think it expedient to include those languages in the list of subjects.

As to the other subjects we speak with more confidence. Foremost among those subjects we place our own language and literature. One or more themes for English composition ought to be proposed. Two papers of questions ought to be set. One of those papers should be so framed as to enable the candidates to show their knowledge of the history and constitution of our country: the other ought to be so framed as to enable them to show the extent of their knowledge of our poets, wits, and philosophers.

In the two great ancient languages there ought to be an examination not less severe than those examinations by which the highest classical distinctions are awarded at Oxford and Cambridge. At least three passages from Latin writers ought to be set, to be translated into English. Subjects should be proposed for original composition, both in Latin verse and in Latin prose; and passages of English verse and prose should be set, to be turned into Latin. At least six passages from Greek writers should be set, to be translated into English. Of these passages, one should be taken from the Homeric poems, one from some historian of the best age, one from some philosopher of the best age, one from some Attic orator, and at least one from the Attic drama. The candidates ought to have a full opportunity of exhibiting their

Appendix B

skill in translating both English prose and English verse into Greek; and there should be a paper of questions which would enable them to show their knowledge of ancient history, both political and literary.

We think that three of the modern languages of the Continent, the French, the Italian, and the German, ought to be among the subjects of examination. Several passages in every one of those languages should be set, to be turned into English; passages taken from English writers should be set, to be turned into French, Italian, and German; and papers of questions should be framed which would enable a candidate to show his knowledge of the civil and literary history of France, Italy, and Germany.

The examination in pure and mixed mathematics ought to be of such a nature as to enable the judges to place in proper order all the candidates, from those who have never gone beyond Euclid's Elements and the first part of algebra up to those who possess the highest acquirements. We think it important, however, that not only the acquirements, but also the mental powers and resources of the competitors should be brought to the test. With this view the examination papers should contain a due proportion of original problems, and of questions calculated to ascertain whether the principles of mathematical science are thoroughly understood. The details will probably be best arranged by some of those eminent men who have lately been moderators in the University of Cambridge, and who know by experience how to conduct the examinations of large numbers of persons simultaneously. It must, however, be borne in mind that the extent and direction of mathematical reading, especially in the higher branches, differ greatly at the different universities of the United Kingdom. The mathematical examination for the Indian service must, therefore, in order to do justice to all candidates, embrace a wider range of questions than is usual at Cambridge, Oxford, or Dublin.

Of late years some natural sciences which do not fall under the head of mixed mathematics, and especially chemistry, geology, mineralogy, botany, and zoology, have been introduced as a part of general education into several of our universities and colleges. There may be some practical difficulty in arranging the details of an examination in these sciences; but it is a difficulty which has, we believe, been at some seats of learning already overcome. We have no hesitation in recommending that there should be at least one paper of questions relating to these branches of knowledge.

We propose to include the moral sciences in the scheme of examination. Those sciences are, it is well known, much studied both at Oxford and at the Scottish universities. Whether this study shall have to do with mere words or with things, whether it shall degenerate into a formal and scholastic pedantry, or shall train the mind for the highest purposes of active life, will depend, to great extent, on the way in which the examination is conducted. We are of opinion that the examination should be conducted in the freest manner, that mere technicalities should be avoided, and that the candidate should not be confined to any particular system. The subjects which fall under this head are the elements of moral and political philosophy, the history of the ancient and modern schools of moral and political philosophy, the science of logic, and the inductive method, of which the *Novum Organum* is the great text-book. The object of the examiners should be rather to put to the test the candidate's powers of mind than to ascertain the extent of his metaphysical reading.

The whole examination ought, we think, to be carried on by means of written papers. The candidates ought not to be allowed the help of any book; nor ought they, after once a subject for composition has been proposed to them, or a paper of questions placed before them, to leave the place of examination till they have finished their work.

It is, of course, not to be expected, that any man of 22 will have made considerable proficiency in all the subjects of examination. An excellent mathematician will often have little Greek, and an excellent Greek scholar will be entirely ignorant of French and Italian. Nothing can be further from our wish than to hold out premiums for knowledge of wide surface and of small depth. We are of opinion that a candidate ought to be allowed no credit at all for taking up a subject in which he is a mere smatterer. Profound and accurate acquaintance with a single language ought to

tell more than bad translations and themes in six languages. A single paper which shows that the writer thoroughly understands the principles of the differential calculus ought to tell more than 20 superficial and incorrect answers to questions about chemistry, botany, mineralogy, metaphysics, logic and English history.

It will be necessary that a certain number of marks should be assigned to each subject, and that the place of a candidate should be determined by the sum total of the marks which he has gained. The marks ought, we conceive, to be distributed among the subjects of examination, in such a manner that no part of the kingdom, and no class of schools, shall exclusively furnish servants to the East India Company. It would be grossly unjust, for example, to the great academical institutions of England, not to allow skill in Greek and Latin versification to have a considerable share in determining the issue of the competition. Skill in Greek and Latin versification has indeed no direct tendency to form a judge, a financier, or a diplomatist. But the youth who does best what all the ablest and most ambitious youths about him are trying to do well will generally prove a superior man; nor can we doubt that an accomplishment by which Fox and Canning, Grenville and Wellesley, Mansfield and Tensterden, first distinguished themselves above their fellows, indicates powers of mind, which, properly trained and directed, may do great service to the State. On the other hand, we must remember that, in the north of this island the art of metrical composition in the ancient languages is very little cultivated, and that men so eminent as Dugald Stewart, Horner, Jeffrey, and Mackintosh, would probably have been quite unable to write a good copy of Latin alcaics, or to translate 10 lines of Shakespeare into Greek iambics. We wish to see such a system of examination established as shall not exclude from the service of the East India Company either a Mackintosh or a Tensterden, either a Canning or a Horner. We have, with an anxious desire to deal fairly by all parts of the United Kingdom, and by all places of liberal education, framed the following scale, which we venture to submit for your consideration:

English language and literature:						
Composition	500
History	500
General literature	500
						<hr/> 1,500
Greek	750
Latin	750
French	375
German	375
Italian	375
Mathematics, pure and mixed	1,000
Natural sciences	500
Moral sciences	500
Sanscrit	375
Arabic	375
						<hr/> 6,875

It seems to us probable, that of the 6,875 marks, which are the maximum, no candidate will ever obtain half. A candidate who is at once a distinguished classical scholar and a distinguished mathematician will be, as he ought to be, certain of success. A classical scholar who is no mathematician, or a mathematician who is no classical scholar, will be certain of success, if he is well read in the history and literature of his own country. A young man who has scarcely any knowledge of mathematics, little Latin and no Greek, may pass such an examination in English, French, Italian, German, geology, and chemistry, that he may stand at the head of the list.

It can scarcely be necessary for us to add, that no expense ought to be grudged which may be necessary to secure the services of the ablest examiners in every branch

Appendix B

of learning. Experience justifies us in pronouncing with entire confidence that, if the examiners be well chosen, it is utterly impossible that the delusive show of knowledge which is the effect of the process popularly called cramming can ever be successful against real learning and ability.

Whether the examinations ought to be held half-yearly or annually is a question which cannot, we think, be satisfactorily determined till after the first experiment has been made.

When the result of the examination has been declared, the successful candidates will not yet be civil servants of the East India Company, but only civil servants elect. It appears from the 40th clause of the Act to be the intention of the Legislature that, before they proceed to the East, there should be a period of probation and a second examination.

In what studies, then, ought the period of probation to be passed? And what ought to be the nature of the second examination?

It seems to us that, from the moment at which the successful candidates, whom we will now call probationers, have been set apart as persons who will, in all probability, have to bear a part in the government of India, they should give their whole minds to the duties of their new position. They must now be considered as having finished their general education, and as having finished it with honour. Their serious studies must henceforth be such as have a special tendency to fit them for their calling.

Of the special knowledge which a civil servant of the Company ought to possess, much can be acquired only in India, and much may be acquired far more easily in India than in England. It would evidently be a mere waste of time to employ a month here in learning what may be better learned in a week at Calcutta or Madras. But there are some kinds of knowledge which are not considered as essential parts of the liberal education of our youth, but which it is most important that a civil servant of the Company should possess, and which he may acquire in England not less easily, indeed more easily, than in India. We conceive that every probationer ought during the interval between his first and his second examination to apply himself vigorously to the acquiring of these kinds of knowledge.

The subjects of his new studies will, we apprehend, be found to range themselves under four heads.

He should, in the first place, make himself well acquainted with the history of India, in the largest sense of the word history. He should study that history, not merely in the works of Orme, of Wilks, and of Mill, but also in the travels of Bernier, in the odes of Sir William Jones, and in the journals of Heber. He should be well informed about the geography of the country, about its natural productions, about its manufactures, about the physical and moral qualities of the different races which inhabit it, and about the doctrines and rites of those religions which have so powerful an influence on the population. He should trace with peculiar care the progress of the British power. He should understand the constitution of our Government, and the nature of the relations between that Government and its vassals, Mussulman, Mahratta, and Rajpoot. He should consult the most important Parliamentary reports and debates on Indian affairs. All this may be done with very much greater facility in England than in any part of India, except at the three seats of Government, if indeed the three seats of Government ought to be excepted.

Secondly, it seems to us to be desirable that every probationer should bestow some attention on the general principles of jurisprudence. The great majority of the civil servants of the East India Company are employed in the administration of justice. A large proportion of them are judges; and some of the most important functions of the collectors are strictly judicial. That the general principles of jurisprudence may be studied here with more advantage than in India will be universally acknowledged.

Thirdly, we think that every probationer ought to prepare himself for the discharge of his duties by paying some attention to financial and commercial science. He should understand the mode of keeping and checking accounts, the principles of banking, the laws which regulate the exchanges, the nature of public debts, funded and unfunded, and the effect produced by different systems of taxation on the prosperity of nations.

We would by no means require him to subscribe any article of faith touching any controverted point in the science of political economy; but it is not too much to expect that he will make himself acquainted with those treatises on political economy which have become standard works. These studies can undoubtedly be prosecuted with more advantage in England than in India.

Fourthly, we think that the study of the vernacular languages of India may with great advantage be begun in England. It is, indeed, only by intercourse with the native population that an Englishman can acquire the power of talking Bengalee or Telugu with fluency. But familiarity with the Bengalee or Telugu alphabet, skill in tracing the Bengalee or Telugu character, and knowledge of the Bengalee or Telugu grammar, may be acquired as quickly in this country as in the East. Nay, we are inclined to believe that an English student will, at his first introduction to an Indian language, make more rapid progress under good English teachers than under pundits, to whom he is often unable to explain his difficulties. We are therefore of opinion that every probationer should acquire in this country an elementary knowledge of at least one Indian language.

If this recommendation be adopted, it will be desirable that the probationers should, immediately after the first examination, be distributed among the Presidencies. It will indeed be desirable that the division of the Bengal civil service into two parts, one destined for the upper and the other for the lower provinces, should be made here at the earliest possible moment, instead of being made, as it now is, at Calcutta.

In what manner the distribution of civil servants among the Presidencies ought henceforth to be made is a question which, though it has not been referred to us, is yet so closely connected with the questions which have been referred to us, that we have been forced to take it into consideration. We are disposed to think that it might be advisable to allow the probationers, according to the order in which they stand at the first examination, to choose their Presidencies. The only objection to this arrangement is, that, as the Presidency of Bengal is generally supposed to be the theatre on which the abilities of a civil servant may be most advantageously displayed, all the most distinguished young men would choose Bengal, and would leave Madras and Bombay to those who stood at the bottom of the list. We admit that this would be an evil; but it would be an evil which must, we conceive, speedily cure itself; for as soon as it becomes notorious that the ablest men in the civil service are all collected in one part of India, and are there stopping each other's way, a probationer who is free to make his choice will prefer some other part of India, where, though the prizes may be a little less attractive, the competition will be much less formidable. If, however, it should be thought inexpedient to allow the probationers to choose their own Presidencies in the manner which we have suggested, it seems to us that the best course would be to make the distribution by lot. We are satisfied that, if the distribution be made arbitrarily, either by the Directors or by Her Majesty's Minister for Indian Affairs, it will be viewed with much suspicion, and will excite much murmuring. At present nobody complains of the distribution. A gentleman who has obtained a Bombay writership for his son is delighted and thankful. It may not be quite so acceptable as a Bengal writership would have been; but it is a free gift; it is a most valuable favour; and it would be the most odious ingratitude to repine because it is not more valuable still. Henceforth an appointment to the civil service of the Company will be not matter of favour, but matter of right. He who obtains such an appointment will owe it solely to his own abilities and industry. If, therefore, the Court of Directors or the Board of Control should send him to Bombay when he wishes to be sent to Bengal, and should send to Bengal young men who in the examination stood far below him, he will naturally think himself injured. His family and friends will espouse his quarrel. A cry will be raised, that one man is favoured because he is related to the Chairman, and another because he is befriended by a Member of Parliament who votes with the Government. It seems to us, therefore, advisable that the distribution of the civil servants among the Presidencies, if it cannot be made the means of rewarding merit, should be left to chance. After the allotment, of course, any two probationers should be at liberty to make an exchange by consent.

Appendix B

But, in whatever manner the distribution may be made, it ought to be made as soon as the issue of the first examination is decided; for, till the distribution is made, it will be impossible for any probationer to know what vernacular language of India it would be most expedient for him to study. The Hindostanee, indeed, will be valuable to him, wherever he may be stationed; but no other living language is spoken over one-third of India. Tamul would be as useless in Bengal, and Bengalee would be as useless at Agra, as Welsh in Portugal.

We should recommend that every probationer, for whatever Presidency he may be destined, should be permitted to choose Hindostanee as the language in which he will pass. A probationer who is to reside in the lower provinces of the Bengal Presidency should be allowed to choose either Hindostanee or Bengalee. A probationer who is to go to the upper provinces should be allowed to choose among Hindostanee, Hindee, and Persian. A probationer who is to go to Madras should be allowed to choose among Hindostanee, Telugu, and Tamul. A probationer who is to go to Bombay should be allowed to choose among Hindostanee, Mahrattae, and Guzeratee.

It is probable that some probationers who have a peculiar talent for learning languages will study more than one of the dialects among which they are allowed to make their choice. Indeed it is not improbable that some who take an interest in philology will apply themselves voluntarily to the Sanscrit and the Arabic. It will hereafter be seen that, though we require as the indispensable condition of passing only an elementary knowledge of one of the vernacular tongues of India, we propose to give encouragement to those students who aspire to be eminent Orientalists.

The four studies, then, to which, in our opinion, the probationers ought to devote themselves during the period of probation, are, first, Indian history; secondly, the science of jurisprudence; thirdly, commercial and financial science; and fourthly, the Oriental tongues.

The time of probation ought not, we think, to be less than one year, nor more than two years.

There should be periodical examinations, at which a probationer of a year's standing must pass, on pain of forfeiting his appointment. This examination should, of course, be in the four branches of knowledge already mentioned as those to which the attention of the probationers ought to be specially directed. Marks should be assigned to the different subjects, as at the first examination; and it seems to us reasonable that an equal number of marks should be assigned to all the four subjects, on the supposition that each probationer is examined in only one of the vernacular languages of India. Sometimes, however, as we have said, a probationer may study more than one of these vernacular languages of India among which he is at liberty to make his choice, or may, in addition to one or more of the vernacular languages of India, learn Sanscrit or Arabic. We think it reasonable that to every language in which he offers himself for examination an equal number of marks should be assigned.

When the marks have been cast up, the probationers who have been examined should be arranged in order of merit. All those who have been two years probationers, and who have, in the opinion of the examiners, used their time well, and made a respectable proficiency, should be declared civil servants of the Company. Every probationer who, having been a probationer only one year, has obtained a higher place than some of the two-year men who have passed, should also be declared a civil servant of the Company. All the civil servants who pass in one year should take rank in the service according to their places in the final examination. Thus a salutary emulation will be kept up to the last moment. It ought to be observed, that the precedence which we propose to give to merit will not be merely honorary, but will be attended by very solid advantages. It is in order of seniority that the members of the civil service succeed to those annuities to which they are all looking forward, and it may depend on the manner in which a young man acquits himself at his final examination, whether he shall remain in India till he is past 50, or shall be able to return to England at 47 or 48.

The instances in which persons who have been successful in the first examination will fail in the final examination, will, we hope and believe, be very few. We hope

and believe, also, that it will very rarely be necessary to expel any probationer from the service on account of grossly prodigal habits, or of any action unbecoming a man of honour. The probationers will be young men superior to their fellows in science and literature; and it is not among young men superior to their fellows in science and literature that scandalous immorality is generally found to prevail. It is notoriously not once in 20 years that a student who has attained high academical distinction is expelled from Oxford or Cambridge. Indeed early superiority in science and literature generally indicates the existence of some qualities which are securities against vice—industry, self-denial, a taste for pleasures not sensual, a laudable desire of honourable distinction, a still more laudable desire to obtain the approbation of friends and relations. We therefore believe that the intellectual test which is about to be established will be found in practice to be also the best moral test that can be devised.

One important question still remains to be considered. Where are the probationers to study? Are they all to study at Haileybury? Is it to be left to themselves to decide whether they will study at Haileybury or elsewhere? Or will the Board of Control reserve to itself the power of determining which of them shall study at Haileybury, and which of them shall be at liberty to study elsewhere?

That the college at Haileybury is to be kept up is clearly implied in the terms of the 37th and 39th clauses of the India Act. That the Board of Control may make regulations which would admit into the civil service persons who have not studied at Haileybury is as clearly implied in the terms of the 40th and 41st clauses. Whether the law ought to be altered is a question on which we do not presume to give any opinion. On the supposition that the law is to remain unaltered, we venture to offer some suggestions which appear to us to be important.

There must be, we apprehend, a complete change in the discipline of the college. Almost all the present students are under 20; almost all the new students will be above 21. The present students have gone to Haileybury from schools where they have been treated as boys. The new students will generally go thither from Universities, where they have been accustomed to enjoy the liberty of men. It will therefore be absolutely necessary that the regulations of the college should be altered, and that the probationers should be subject to no more severe restraint than is imposed on a bachelor of arts at Cambridge or Oxford.

There must be an extensive change even in the buildings of the college. At present, each student has a single small chamber, which is at once his parlour and bedroom. It will be impossible to expect men of two or three and twenty, who have long been accustomed to be lodged in a very different manner, to be content with such accommodation.

There must be a great change in the system of study. At present, the students generally go to Haileybury before they have completed their general education. Their general education and their special education, therefore, go on together. Henceforth, the students must be considered as men whose general education has been finished, and finished with great success. Greek, Latin, and mathematics will no longer be parts of the course of study. The whole education will be special, and ought, in some departments, to be of a different kind from that which has hitherto been given.

We are far, indeed, from wishing to detract from the merit of those professors, all of them highly respectable and some of them most eminent, who have taught law and political economy at Haileybury. But it is evident that a course of lectures on law or political economy given to boys of 18, who have been selected merely by favour, must be a very different thing from a course of lectures on law or political economy given to men of 23, who have been selected on account of their superior abilities and attainments. As respects law, indeed, we doubt whether the most skilful instructor will be able at Haileybury to impart to his pupils that kind of knowledge which it is most desirable that they should acquire. Some at least of the probationers ought, we conceive, not merely to attend lectures, and to read well-chosen books on jurisprudence, but to see the actual working of the machinery by which justice is administered. They ought to hear legal questions, in which great principles are

Appendix B

involved, argued by the ablest counsel, and decided by the highest courts in the realm. They ought to draw up reports of the arguments both of the advocates and of the judges. They ought to attend both civil and criminal trials, and to take notes of the evidence, and of the discussions and decisions respecting the evidence. It might be particularly desirable that they should attend the sittings of the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council when important appeals from India are under the consideration of that tribunal. A probationer, while thus employed, should regularly submit his notes of arguments and of evidence to his legal instructor for correction. Such a training as this would, we are inclined to think, be an excellent preparation for official life in India; and we must leave it to the Board of Control to consider whether any plan can be devised by which such a training can be made compatible with residence at Haileybury.

We have, &c.

(signed) *T. B. Macaulay.*

Ashburton.

Henry Melvill.

Benjamin Jowett.

John George Shaw Lefevre.

November, 1854

Gentlemen,

India Board, 30 November 1854.

I HAVE the honour to enclose to you, for the information of the Court of Directors of the East India Company, a copy of the Report which has been drawn up by the gentlemen who at my request have been kind enough to give me their valuable assistance in the consideration of the best mode of carrying into effect that part of the Act of 1853 for the government of India which provides that the public admissions to the civil service of the East India Company shall be by competition.

I concur in the general tenor of their Report. I propose that 20 candidates shall be selected at an examination to be held in the course of the ensuing year; and as soon as the necessary regulations, which require very careful consideration, have been framed, notice will be given of the time when it will be held.

I have also had to consider what course should be adopted with regard to the successful candidates at such examination, and the best means of imparting to them such further instruction as may be thought necessary before their final appointment to India. In this question is involved the continued maintenance of the College of Haileybury.

Upon the best consideration which I have been able to give to the subject, this college, as it is now constituted for the education of youths from the age of 17, appears to me to be altogether unsuited to the instruction of gentlemen, many of whom may have passed through the full course of education at one or other of the universities, and some of whom may perhaps have even entered upon their studies for the bar.

Nor does it appear to me that any change in the constitution of Haileybury would render it possible that gentlemen residing there would have the opportunity of acquiring the knowledge which it is most desirable that all the civil servants of the East India Company should possess.

No qualification is so necessary to them, whether they be employed in the judicial branch of the service or in the combined duties of collectors and magistrates in India, as a thorough knowledge of the principles of law, combined with a practical acquaintance with the mode of conducting civil and criminal suits. Nothing, in my opinion, can conduce so much to the acquisition of this practical knowledge as attendance during the progress of trials in courts of justice; and the opportunity of doing this is so much greater in the metropolis than elsewhere, that this circumstance alone would render London by far the most convenient place for their residence. It seems to me also that arrangements may be made in London more easily than elsewhere for their instruction in the other branches of knowledge, of which they ought to have some acquaintance, in order to enable them to discharge with efficiency the multifarious duties which are so often thrown upon the civil service in India.

I have come to the conclusion, therefore, that it is inexpedient permanently to maintain Haileybury College. It will be necessary, however, that it should continue in a state of efficiency so long as is requisite, in order to educate those gentlemen who have been nominated to vacancies which occurred previous to the 30th of April last. I see by the number of appointments not yet taken up that if the college is kept full they will be exhausted by the admissions of January 1856.

After that period, therefore, no admissions ought to be permitted, and the college will be maintained only so long as to enable those gentlemen to complete their education there.

I propose to introduce a Bill into Parliament for the purpose of relieving the East India Company from the obligation under which they now are to maintain the College of Haileybury, and due provision will of course be made for those officers of the establishment who remain upon it at the time of the closing of the college as have a claim to such a provision.

I have, &c.

The Chairs,
&c. &c. &c.

(signed) Charles Wood,

Appendix B

REGULATIONS for the EXAMINATION of CANDIDATES for Appointments to the CIVIL SERVICE of the EAST INDIA COMPANY

Note.—An examination will take place in July 1855, by examiners to be appointed by the Board of Commissioners for the Affairs of India, of candidates for appointments to the civil service of the East India Company.

Public notice will hereafter be given of the precise day on which the examination will be held. Twenty appointments will be awarded, if so many candidates are declared by the examiners to be duly qualified.

REGULATIONS

1. Any natural-born subject of Her Majesty who shall be desirous of entering the civil service of the Company will be entitled to be examined at such examination, provided he shall, on or before the 1st of May 1855, have transmitted to the Board of Commissioners:

- (a) A certificate of his age being above 18 years and under 23 years.
- (b) A certificate, signed by a physician or surgeon, of his having no disease, constitutional affection, or bodily infirmity, unfitting him for the civil service of the Company.
- (c) A certificate of good moral character, signed by the head of the school or college at which he has last received his education; or, if he has not received education at any school or college since the year 1852, then such proof of good moral character as may be satisfactory to the Board of Commissioners.
- (d) A statement of those of the branches of knowledge hereinafter enumerated in which he desires to be examined.

2. The examination will take place only in the following branches of knowledge: English Language and Literature:—

Composition	500
English literature and history, including that of the laws and constitution	1,000
	<hr/> 1,500
Language, literature, and history of Greece	750
" " " Rome	750
" " " France	375
" " " Germany	375
" " " Italy	375
Mathematics, pure and mixed	1,000
Natural science, that is, chemistry, electricity and magnetism, natural history, geology, and mineralogy	500
Moral sciences, that is, logic, mental, moral, and political philosophy	500
Sanskrit language and literature	375
Arabic language and literature	375
	<hr/> 6,875

3. The merit of the persons examined will be estimated by marks, according to the ordinary system in use at several of the universities, and the numbers set opposite to each branch in the preceding paragraph denote the greatest number of marks that can be obtained in respect of it.

4. No candidate will be allowed any marks in respect of any subject of examination unless he shall, in the opinion of the examiners, possess a competent knowledge of that subject.

5. The examination will be conducted by means of printed questions and written answers, and by *visu voce* examination, as the examiners may deem necessary.

6. After the examination shall have been completed, the examiners shall add up the marks obtained by each candidate in respect of each of the subjects in which he shall have been examined, and shall set forth, in order of merit, the names of the 20 candidates who shall have obtained a greater aggregate number of marks than any of the remaining candidates; and such 20 candidates shall be deemed to be selected candidates for the civil service of the East India Company. Their choice of the Presidency in India to which they shall be appointed shall be determined by the order in which they stand on such list.

7. In August 1856, and August 1857, further examinations of the selected candidates will take place by examiners appointed by the Board of Commissioners for the Affairs of India in the following subjects:

Law, including the ordinary rules of taking evidence and the mode of conducting civil and criminal trials	1,000
The history of India	400
Political economy	400
Any language of India in which the selected candidate shall have given notice of his desire to be examined	200

and such further examinations will be conducted in the same manner as that above described. (The numbers set opposite to each subject denote the greatest number of marks which can be obtained in respect of such subjects.)

8. Each selected candidate, desirous of being examined at either of the further examinations of 1856 and 1857, shall, two months previously to such examination, transmit to the Board of Commissioners for the Affairs of India a statement mentioning the language or languages of India in which he is desirous of being examined.

9. Any selected candidate, who, having been examined at the further examination of 1856, shall not have passed, may, nevertheless, be again examined at the further examination of 1857.

10. Any selected candidate who shall not have passed at one or the other of the further examinations of 1856 and 1857, shall be struck off the list of selected candidates.

11. The selected candidates who, at either of such further examinations, shall be deemed by the examiners to have a competent knowledge of law, the history of India, political economy, and at least one language of India, shall be adjudged to have passed and to be entitled to be appointed to the civil service of the East India Company; and the names of the selected candidates who shall have so passed shall be placed in a list in the order of their merit in such examinations, estimated as above by the total number of marks which they shall have obtained in respect of all the subjects in which they shall have been examined at such examination.

12. The seniority in the civil service of the East India Company of the selected candidates shall be determined by the date of the further examination at which they shall be adjudged to have passed; and, as between those who passed at the same further examination, their seniority in such civil service shall be determined according to the order in which they stand on the list resulting from such examination.

13. No person will, even after such examination, be allowed to proceed to India unless he shall comply with the regulations in force at the time for the civil service of the East India Company, and shall be of sound bodily health and good moral character.

India Board, 26 January 1855.

R. Lowe.